Coute on Resolusitur

In Re-Contest of the seats of

MR. FULTON,

MR. HYNDMAN,

MR. REEd, and

Mr. Fording,

the regularly elected delegates from the Fourth Legislative District of Allegheny County.

# BRIEF OF THE SITTING DELEGATES.

# HISTORY OF THE CASE.

The contest in this case arose under the following circumstances: The Republican County Executive Committee of Allegheny County called district conventions to be held on Tuesday, April 1st, 1884, for the purpose of electing delegates to the Republican State Convention, the delegates so elected to meet within five days in Congressional convention in their respective Congressional districts, and elect delegates to the National Convention, to be held at Chicago. This action of the Republican County Committee was not satisfactory to certain republicans of the county, and they organized a committee outside the County Committee, called "The Committee of One Hundred," for the purpose, among other things, of endeavoring to secure delegates to the State Convention from the County of Allegheny in the interest of Mr. Blaine in his candidacy for the presidency. There was practically no contest in the Senatorial and Legislative Districts within the territory composing the 23d Congressional District, but in the Senatorial and Legislative Districts

within the 22d Congressional District there was a hot and bitter campaign. This campaign, on the part of the Committee of One Hundred, was simply without parallel in the politics of Allegheny County, for its fraud, misrepresentation and corruption. Of the 150 sub-districts composing the 22d Congressional District, the regular county organization carried over 100, but owing to the overlapping of the country districts, had the Citizens Committee of One Hundred succeeded in electing two more delegates to the Fourth Legislative District Convention, they would have sent with a minority vote a delegation to represent the district at Chicago. The Fourth Legislative District is composed of twenty-five wards of the City of Pittsburgh, viz: the 11th, and from the 13th to the 36th, both inclusive, in which there are 91 election districts. The contest was interesting and close. The so-called Regulars carried  $46\frac{1}{2}$  delegates out of the 91, the Citizens or Independents,  $44\frac{1}{2}$ .

The night before the convention, the delegates representing the Committee of One Hundred met in caucus in the rooms of Iron Age, in the City of Pittsburgh, of which meeting Mr. H. J. Bigger, one of the delegates, was elected chairman, and passed unanimously a resolution, that in case they failed to organize the convention in their own interest, they would bolt and organize one of their own. Pursuant to the call of the chairman of the County Committee, the Fourth Legislative Convention met in the place appointed, on April 1st, and organized by electing Andrew Fulton chairman. During the progress of the ballot for chairman, the leaders of the delegates of the Committee of One Hundred protested against the vote of the substitute of Jacob Nagle, of the 13th ward, and that of John Coslett, of the 26th ward, alleging that they had been elected and instructed for their candidate, and demanded to have their votes recorded in accordance with what they claimed to be their instructions. Independently of the right of delegates representing districts to cast their votes as they please, this was a bold and false claim, as the Committee of One Hundred had published its list of delegates on the day before and the day of the primary elections, and advertised a man by the name of William Jones as a candidate against Coslett. They had also advertised Nagle's name as one of their delegates, but as will be seen by the

affidavits filed herewith, both Coslett and Nagle had been elected in the interest of the regular organization.

The sitting members submit the annexed papers, and rely upon their regularity, and the many and repeated decisions of Republican county, state, and National conventions, to sustain their right to seats in this body; notably, the decision at Cincinnati, in 1876, in the case of John H. Hampton, representing the 22d Congressional District in the National Convention. He was unanimously instructed, both by the county and state conventions, and personally pledged himself, to vote for John F. Hartranft, as Pennsylvania's candidate for the presidency; and he went to Cincinnati, claimed the right to vote for himself, and cast his vote for Mr. Blaine. Upon the protest of the Pennsylvania delegation, Mr. Edward McPherson, who was President of the National Convention of 1876, ruled that Mr. Hampton was entitled to vote as he pleased, and was only answerable to his own conscience for the propriety of his vote. We also cite the case of the West Virginia delegation in the National Convention of 1880, where the delegate and his alternate were both absent, and the chairman of the delegation attempted to cast the vote of the whole delegation, and upon objection, the claim was not allowed, which ruling was in the following words: "In calling the roll, the correctness of the announcement of the vote of West Virginia being questioned by a delegate, the chair directed the roll of that state to be called. The name of one of the delegates borne on the roll was called, that delegate did not answer to his name, thereupon the name of his alternate borne on the roll was called, and the alternate did not answer to his name. The Chair rules, that no other person except that delegate or the alternate can legally answer to either of these names in the Convention." (See Proceedings National Convention of 1880, page 205.)

Independently of action of the Committee on Contested Seats the representatives of the regular organization had a clear majority of the convention. When the representatives of the Committee of One Hundred bolted the convention, two of their men, Reed and Smith, refused to join the bolt, so that, under any circumstances, the convention held in the rooms of the *Iron Age* represented con-

siderably less than half the number of districts contained in the Fourth Legislative District.

The allegation of the contestants that two of their delegates were unduly influenced to vote against their instructions is, to put it mildly, simply untrue and intended to cover their attempted purchase of Mr. Best, Mr. Coslett and Mr. Nagle, delegates of the regular organization as is shown by the affidavits filed herewith. The independents bolted in accordance with a prearranged programme determined on the night before, and the contest here is wholly without merit and should be so treated.

Chairman's call convening the Republican Committee of Allegheny County:

HEADQUARTERS ALLEGHENY COUNTY
REPUBLICAN EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE.

A meeting of the committee will be held in Select Council Chamber, Municipal Hall, Pittsburgh, on Saturday, March 8, 1884. at 2.30 o clock P. M., for the purpose of fixing the time for the holding of conventions to elect delegates to the Republican State Convention, and other matters of importance.

By order of

C. S. FETTERMAN,

. Attest—John Gripp,

Chairman.

Secretary.

Resolution of the committee ordering primary meetings to be held throughout the county, to elect delegates to the several Legislative and Senatorial Conventions, adopted March 8, 1884.

Resolved, First—That conventions be held in the several Senatorial and Legislative districts of this county, on Tuesday, April 1, 1884, at such hours as may hereafter be designated in the call, for the purpose of electing Senatorial and Legislative delegates to the Republican State Convention, to meet in Harrisburg, April 16, 1884; and the primary meetings be held in the several election districts of the county, to elect delegates to the said several Senatorial and Legislative Conventions, on Saturday, March 29, 1884, between the hours of 4 and 7 o'clock P. M., said primary meetings and conventions to be conducted in accordance with the provisions of the Act of Assembly relating to primary meetings, approved June 25, 1881, and the rules of this committee relating thereto.

Second—That the delegates elected by the Senatorial and Legislative Conventions above ordered be and are hereby authorized and required to

meet in convention in their respective Congressional districts within five days after their election, at the call of the chairman of this committee, and at such places as he may designate, and there elect two delegates each, to represent said Congressional districts respectively at the Republican National Convention, to be held in Chicago, June 3, 1884, and the action of the said convention to be certified by the respective officers thereof to the Republican National Convention.

Third—That the chairman publish the call for said convention in accord-

ance with the above resolution.

Fourth—That the chairman appoint a committee of three to secure places for holding said conventions.

In pursuance of above resolution, the following call was published by the chairman of the Republican Committee of Allegheny County:

In accordance with the action of the Republican Executive Committee, the Republican voters of Allegheny county will hold Primary Elections on Saturday, March 29, 1884, between the hours of 4 and 7 o'clock P. M., to elect Senatorial and Representative delegates to Senatorial and Representative Conventions, to be held in their several Senatorial and Representative districts, on Tuesday, April 1, 1884, to elect Senatorial and Representative delegates to the State convention to be held at Harrisburg, on April 16, 1884.

By the action of said committee the delegates elected from the several Senatorial and Representative districts to the State Convention were also authorized and instructed to meet within five days after their election at the call of the chairman of this committee, in Congressional Convention in their several respective Congressional districts, and elect two delegates to represent such Congressional districts in the National Convention to be

held at Chicago, June 3, 1884.

Additional delegates shall be elected in the several districts thereto entitled, according to Rule 1, and the amendment thereto, of said committee.

The hours and places for holding said conventions and the temporary chairman thereof will hereafter be announced.

By order of the committee,

C. S. FETTERMAN,

JOHN GRIPP.

Secretary.

Chairman.

# NOTICE OF APPOINTMENT OF TEMPORARY CHAIRMAN.

PITTSBURGH, March 28, 1884.

GEO. T. OLIVER, Esq.

Dear Sir:—I hereby designate and appoint you Temporary Chairman of the Fourth Legislative District Convention, which meets at Select Council Chamber, Pittsburgh, Tuesday, April 1, 1884, at 3 o'clock P. M.

Under the Rules of the committee you are required to be in attendance at the Headquarters of the committee, No. 125 Fifth avenue, on Monday, March 31st, 1884, between the hours of 12 o'clock noon and 3 o'clock P. M. to receive notices of contests.

By order of the Committee,

C. S. FETTERMAN,
Chairman.

Attest—John Gripp, Secretary.

Certificate of Temporary Chairman, as to the selection of Temporary Secretaries:

I hereby certify that the following delegates, viz.: Benj. Weaver, Chas. R. Miller, David Reese, R. W. Thompson, P. W. Seibert, Jas. McKnight, were chosen Temporary Secretaries of the convention, and officiated as such until a permanent organization was effected.

Respectfully,

GEO. T. OLIVER.

Roll of the convention as made in accordance with Rule 7, of the Republican County Executive Committee, and vote by district on permanent organization. The names of C. P. Tiers and Andrew Fulton having been placed in nomination for permanent chairman of the convention:

11th Wd. 1st Dist. C. L. Smith Voted for Andrew Fulton. C. P. Tiers. 2dG. W. Rankin,  $\frac{1}{2}$  vote, Jas. S. Nesbitt,  $\frac{1}{2}$  vote, Andrew Fulton. C. P. Tiers. Robert Miller 3dC. P. Tiers. 66 Jno. F. Buchanan 4th C. P. Tiers. C. P. Tiers. John Smith 66 5th 66 13th Wd. 1st F. C. Miller 66 Andrew Fulton. 2dS. J. Dawson Jno. B. Anderson 66 C. P. Tiers. 3d46 Andrew Fulton. 4thAvery Coulson

14th Wd.	1st Dist.	J. P. Andrews	Voted for	Andrew Fulton.
11011 11 (11	2d "	C. L. Magee	"	Andrew Fulton.
	3d "	Andrew Fulton	"	C. P. Tiers.
	4th "	James McKnight	66	Andrew Fulton.
	5th "	R. P. Douglas	66	C. P. Tiers.
	6th "	John Small	66	Andrew Fulton.
15th Wd.	1st "	Ruben Jenkins	"	C. P. Tiers.
10th Wa.	2d "	Julius Loeffler	. 66	C. P. Tiers.
	3d "	H. W. Borntrager	66	C. P. Tiers.
16th Wd.	1st "	W. Thomas	"	Andrew Fulton.
form wa.	2d "	Fred. Clouse	66	Andrew Fulton.
	3d "	James Gettes	. 66	Andrew Fulton.
	4th "	Sam'l Lichtenthaler	, "	Andrew Fulton.
	5th "	John Ryan	"	C. P. Tiers.
17th Wd.	1st "	Sam'l Donaldson	"	C. P. Tiers.
Tyon Was	2d "	Jas. Daugherty	"	C. P. Tiers.
	3d "	C. R. Miller	"	C. P. Tiers.
	4th "	T. B. Sutch	66	Andrew Fulton.
	5th "	John Given	"	Andrew Fulton.
	6th "	C. P. Tiers	"	Andrew Fulton.
	7th "	P. W. Seibert	"	Andrew Fulton.
18th Wd.	1st "	Geo. Clause	"	Andrew Fulton.
	2d "	Amos Roadman	66	C. P. Tiers.
19th Wd.	1st "	D. L. McClintock	66	Andrew Fulton.
	2d "	S. C. Thomas	"	Andrew Fulton.
	3d "	A. M. Lee	.66	Andrew Fulton.
	4th "	J. A. Bachelor	. "	Andrew Fulton.
	5th "	Jno. H. Smith	"	Andrew Fulton.
20th Wd.	1st ".	Geo. W. Davis	46	Andrew Fulton.
	2d "	John A. Reed	66	C. P. Tiers.
	3d "	Moses H. Housema		C. P. Tiers.
	4th "	David A. Reese	66	C. P. Tiers.
	5th "	John Loefler	"	C. P. Tiers.
21st Wd.		W. F. Aull	"	C. P. Tiers.
	2d "	R. G. MacGonigle	66	Andrew Fulton.
	3d "	H. J. Bigger	"	C. P. Tiers.
	4th "	R. W. Thompson	"	Andrew Fulton.
001 777 1	5th "	H. P. Kuhn	"	C. P. Tiers.
22d Wd.	1st "	W. H. Stewart	"	C. P. Tiers.
	2d "	R. T. Vandevort	66	C. P. Tiers.
001 W1	3d : "	J. S. Wightman	66	C. P. Tiers.
23d Wd.	1st "	Paul Denkel	66	C. P. Tiers.
	2d '' 3d "	A. C. Smith	"	Andrew Fulton.
	3d "	Harry Brown	6.6	Andrew Fulton.

```
24th Wd. 1st Dist. Mark Donley
                                         Voted for Andrew Fulton
           2d
                     Marshall Brobeck
                                                   Andrew Fulton.
                66
                     D. E. Weaver
           3d
                                                   Andrew Fulton.
                "
25th Wd.
                     J. W. Bonner
           1st
                                                   Andrew Fulton.
                                              66
                "
           2d
                     Jas. McCracken
                                                   C. P. Tiers.
                     Jno. D. Lloyd
                                              66
                                                   C. P. Tiers.
           3d
                66
                                              66
                                                   Andrew Fulton.
           4th
                     Morgan McDonald
                66
                                              66
26th Wd.
           1st
                     Jno. Coslett
                                                   Andrew Fulton.
                     Jno. Vogt
                                              66
                                                   C. P. Tiers.
           2d
                66
                                              66
           3d
                     Jno. T. Shephard
                                                   Andrew Fulton.
                                              "
                "
                    James Drake
                                                   Andrew Fulton.
           4th
                                              66
                66
           5th
                     Robert Reed
                                                   Andrew Fulton.
                                              66
                6%
27th Wd.
                     F. H. Fritz
                                                   Andrew Fulton.
           1st
                66
                                              66
           2d
                                                   C. P. Tiers.
                     Harry Moore
                     G. G. Wagner
                "
                                              66
           3d
                                                   Andrew Fulton.
                     Jas. W. Blaney
                                              66
                66
28th Wd.
                                                   C. P. Tiers.
           1st
                66
                                              66
                                                   C. P. Tiers.
                     Jno. J. Thomas
           2d
                66
                                              66
                     Emanuel Bird
                                                   C. P. Tiers.
           3d
                                              66
                66
           4th
                     Frank Barr
                                                   Andrew Fulton.
                                              66
                                                   C. P. Tiers.
29th Wd.
                     Jedd Clark
           1st
                66
                                              66
           2d
                     J. Martin Schaefer
                                                   Andrew Fulton.
                                                   C. P. Tiers.
           3d
                     F. C. Beinhauer
                                              66
                                                   C. P. Tiers.
                "
30th Wd.
           1st
                     Patrick Harkins
                                              66
                66
                                                   C. P. Tiers.
           2d
                     Jno. Stewart
           3d
                     Sam'l Barker
                                              66
                                                   Andrew Fulton.
                66
                                              66
31st Wd.
                                                   Andrew Fulton.
           1st
                     Henry Best
                "
                                              66
                     Andrew Binder
                                                   Andrew Fulton.
           2d
                                              66
                     William Dierst
32d Wd.
                                                   Andrew Fulton.
           1st
                "
                                              "
                                                   C. P. Tiers.
           2d
                     Edward B. Sawver
                                              66
                66
           3d
                     Jacob Bredneake
                                                   Andrew Fulton.
                66
                                              66
33d Wd.
                    Peter Aman
                                                   Andrew Fulton.
                66.
                                                   C. P. Tiers.
                                              66
34th Wd.
                     Jas. Black
           1st
                                                   C. P. Tiers.
                "
                                              66
           2d
                     Robt. S. Campbell
                                                   C. P. Tiers.
                "
                     W. F. Hood
35th Wd.
           1st
                66
                                              66
           2d
                     Jno. G. Smith
                                                   C. P. Tiers.
                66
                                              66
36th Wd.
                     Henry Barlow
                                                   Andrew Fulton.
           1st
                                                   C. P. Tiers.
                "
                                              66
           2d
                     Benj. Evans
                                              66
                                                   C. P. Tiers.
           3d
                     W. C. Taylor
       Total number of votes,
                                    91.
       Andrew Fulton received
                                    461.
       C. P. Tiers received
                                    443.
```

By vote of the convention the temporary secretaries were continued as permanent secretaries.

I hereby certify that the above is a true and correct report of the proceedings had during the organization of the Fourth Legislative District Convention.

Geo. T. Oliver,

Temporary Chairman.

The chairman and vice chairman reported to the convention the following named delegates, whom they appointed as the committee on contested seats, viz.: F. H. Fritz, Wm. Dierst, Mark Donley, James Drake, Jas. S. Daugherty, John Thomas and J. S. Wightman. The Chair designating F. H. Fritz as chairman of the committee.

Thereupon the committee was duly sworn, in presence of the convention, in accordance with Rule 9 of the Republican County Committee.

The committee on contested seats reported as follows: that all the sitting delegates are entitled to participate in the convention, with this exception, viz.: Second district, Eighteenth ward, Andrew Harper, contestant, admitted in place of Amos Roadman; Second district, Twentieth ward, seat declared vacant, and district entitled to no vote or voice in the convention. First district, 30th ward, Richard Thomas, contestant, admitted in place of Patrick Harkins.

The Chair ordered the secretaries to complete the roll in accordance with the report on contested seats.

The roll of the convention was then called and all the delegates answered to their names, whereupon the Chair announced that the convention was ready to receive nominations. The following names were presented to the convention:

Andrew Fulton, Jas. B. Hyndman, Robert Reed, Thos. Fording, Wm. M. Hartzell, Geo. W. Irwin, S. D. Warmcastle, W. C. Taylor.

The Chair directed that the roll be called, and that each delegate should rise in his place, upon the call of his name and district, and announce his choice for delegates to the State Convention.

9			
And Andrew Fulton	had	$48\frac{1}{3}$	votes.
James B. Hyndman	66	$48\frac{1}{2}$	"
Robert Reed	"	$47\frac{1}{2}$	"
Thomas Fording	"	$48\frac{1}{2}$	66
S. D. Warmcastle	"	$5\frac{\overline{i}}{2}$	66
Geo. W. Irwin	66	$5\frac{1}{5}$	"
W. C. Taylor	66	$5 ilde{ ilde{1}}_2$	"
Wm. M. Hartzell	66	$5\overline{\frac{1}{5}}$	"

B

The following is a tabulated statement of the vote of the convention by districts:

					Andrew Fulton.	James B. Hyndman.	Robert Reed.	Thomas Fording.	S. D. Warmcastle.	Geo. W. Irwin.	W. C. Taylor.	Wm. M. Hartzell.
11th	wa	1	Dist	C. L. Smith	1	1	1	1			•	
11011	** u,	2	1150.	Jas. S. Nesbitt								
"	"	2	"	G. W. Rankin	$\frac{1}{2}$	$\frac{1}{2}$	$\frac{1}{2}$	$\frac{1}{2}$	1	1	1	1
66	"	3	66	Robt. Miller					$\frac{1}{2}$	$\frac{1}{2}$	$\frac{\frac{1}{2}}{1}$	$\frac{\frac{1}{2}}{1}$
"	66	4	66	John T. Buchanan					1	1	1	1
"	"	5	46	John Smith					1	1	1	1
13th	"	1	66	F. C. Miller					1	1	1	1
"	66	2	"	Samuel J. Dawson.	1	1	1	1	_		•	
"	"	3	66	John B. Anderson	J.	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
66	"	4	"	Avery Coulson	1	1	1	1		-	•	-
14th	"	1	"	Wm. R. Ford, substitute for J. P. Andrews	1	1	1	1				
"	"	2	"	C. L. Magee	1	1	1	1				
"	"	3	"	Andrew Fulton	1	1	1	1				
"	"	4	66	James McKnight	1	1	1	1				
"	"	5	"	Robert P. Douglass								
"	"	6	66	John Small	1	1	1	1				
15th	"	1	"	Ruben Jenkins								
"	"	2	"	Julius Loefler								
"	"	3	4 6	H. W. Borntrager								
16th	"	1	"	W. Thomas	1	1	1	1				
"	"	2	"	Fred. Clouse		1	1	1				
"	"	3	"	James Gettis		1	1	1				
"	"	4	"	Samuel Lichtenthaler	1	1	1	1				
"	"	5	"	John Ryan								
17th	"	1	4.4	Samuel Donaldson								
"	"	2	"	James Dougherty								
"	"	3	"	C. R. Miller								
"	"	4	"	T. B. Sutch	1	1	1	1				
"	"	5	"	John Givens	1	1	1	1				
46	"	,6	"	C. P. Tiers								
"	"	7	"	P. W. Seibert	1							

					Andrew Fulton.	James B. Hyndman.	Robert Reed.	Thomas Fording.	S. D. Warmeastle. Geo. W. Irwin. W. C. Taylor. Wm. M. Hartzell.
1046	777.3	1	D:	A Cas Clause	4	-		_	
10111	wa.	2	ווי	t. Geo. Clause	1	1	1	1	
19th	66	1	"	D. L. McClintock	1 1	1	1	1	
((	"	2	66	S. C. Thomas	1	1	1	1	
66	"	3	66	A. M. Lee	1	1	1	1	
66	66	4	66	J. A. Batchelor	1	1	1	1	
"	66	5	44	John H. Smith	1	1	1	_	
$20 \mathrm{th}$	"	1	44	Geo. W. Davis	1	1	1	1	
"	"	2	دد	Not entitled to representation. See report of committee on contested seats.				_	
44	6.6	3	"	M. H. Houseman					
"	"	4	٤٤	Wm. Rees, {Substitute for David Rees					
66	66	5	16	John Loeffler					
21st	66	1	66	Wm. F. Aull					
"	16	2	66	R. G. McGonigle	1	1	1	1	
, (	"	3	"	03					
66		4	"	R. W. Thompson	1	1	1	1	
00.3	"	5	"	A. P. Kuhn					
22d	"	1	ζζ	W. H. Stewart					
"	"	2	"	R. T. Vandevort					
 23d	"	3	66	J. S. Wightman					
20U	"	2	66	Paul Denkle	4		_	_	
66	"	3	66	A. C. Smith	1	1	1	1	
24th	66	1	66	Harry Brown		1		1	
"	"	2	66	Marshal Brobeck		1	1	1	
"	"	3	44	D. E. Weaver	1	1	1	1 1	
25th	"	1	66	H. B. Fischer { Substitute for J. W. Bonner.	1	1	1	1	
"	66	2	66	James McCracken					
"	"	3	"	John D. Lloyd					
"	66	4	66	Andrew Lew Substitute for Morg. McDonald.	1	1	1	1	

				•	Andrew Fulton.	James B. Hyndman.	Robert Reed.	Thomas Fording.	S. D. Warmcastle. Geo. W. Irwin. W. C. Taylor. Wm. M. Hartzell.
26th	Wd.	1 ]	Dist	John Coslett	1	1	1	1	
"	"	2	(;	John Vogt				_	
"	"	3	"	John F. Sheppard	1	1	1	1	•
"	"	4	"	James Drake	1	1	1	1	
"	44	5	"	Robert Reed	1	1	1	1	
27th	"	1	"	F. H. Fritz	1	1	1	1	
. (	6 (	2	"	Harry Moore					
"	"	3	"	G. G. Wagner	1	1	1	1	
28th	"	1	"	James W. Blaney				,	
"	66	2	"	John J. Thomas					
"	61	Ż	"	Emanuel Bird					
"	"	4	"	Frank Barr	1	1	1	1	
29th	"	1	46	Jed Clark				•	
66	"	2	"	J. M. Shafer	1	1		1	
6 (	"	3	"	F. C. Bienhaur					
30th	66	1	"	Richard Thomas	1	1	1	1	
"	"	2	"	John Stewart					
٠.	"	3	"	Samuel Barker	1	1	1	1	
31st	"	1	46	Henry Best	1	1	1	1	
"	"	2	"	Andrew Binder	1	1	1	1	
32d	44	1	46	William Dierst	1	1	1	1	•
"	"	2	66	Edward B. Sawyer					
"	"	3	"	Jacob Brednecht, Jr	1	1	1	1	
33d	66			Peter Aman	1	1	1	1	
34th	"	1	"	James Black					
"	"	2	66	Robert S. Campbell					
$35  ext{th}$	"	1	"	Wm. F. Hood					
"	"	2	66	John G. Smith					
36th	"	1	66	Henry Barlow	1	1	1	1	
"	6.6	2	"	Benjamin Weaver					
"	"	3	"	W. C. Taylor					

ALLEGHENY COUNTY, 88.

Personally appeared before me, the subscriber, an alderman in and for the city of Pittsburgh, said county, John Coslett, who being duly sworn according to law, doth depose that he was elected a delegate from the First district, Twenty-sixth ward, Pittsburgh, to the Fourth Legislative District Convention, in the interest and for the election of Messrs. Fulton, Hyndman, Fording and Reed, as delegates to the State Convention. That on Sunday evening, March 30, 1884, a gentleman called at my house and informed me that Louis Heinrich desired to see me; I went with him to Louis Heinrich's house, and Mr. Heinrich then spoke to me of my election, and offered me \$40,\$50 and \$100, and secure me my old position in Byers' Mill for me, if I would transfer my credentials or go to the convention and act with them; this I then and there refused. rich) also said that he was authorized by Mr. Byers to make this offer. Yesterday evening, viz.: March 31, 1884, and this morning, April 1, 1884, Ebenezer M. Byers, called on me, and offered · that if I would give him my credentials, or come over and act with them, he would give me my old position back again, and that my pay would begin from the day I was discharged. Deponent further avers, that prior to November, 1883, he had been employed at Byers' mill as a scrapper at a scrap furnace for a period of three years, and prior to that time was employed at the same mill as a puddler. In November last he was discharged and has been out of employment since.

JOHN COSLETT.

Sworn and subscribed to before me, the 1st day of April, 1884.

> C. O'Donnell, Alderman.

ALLEGHENY COUNTY, ss.

Personally appeared before me, the subscriber, an alderman in and for the city of Pittsburgh, said county, John Coslett, who being duly sworn according to law, deposes and says, that he was a delegate to the 'Fourth Legislative District Convention, duly elected to represent the 1st District, 26th Ward, Pittsburgh; that Andrew Fulton, a candidate for delegate to the State Convention, was the gentleman who requested me to become a candidate as delegate to said convention, in the interest and for the election of himself, Mr. Fording, Mr. Reed and Mr. Hyndman. It was at his request, and none other, that I ran as such delegate, and any allegations to the contrary are false and untrue, as Wm. Jones, a resident of said district was my opponent, and fought my election from the time the polls opened until it closed. He, Mr. Jones, was the Blaine delegate, and was so advertised by the committee representing the Blaine faction.

JOHN COSLETT.

Sworn and subscribed to before me, the 1st day of April, 1884.

C. O'Donnell,

Alderman.

# ALLEGHENY COUNTY, 88.

Jacob Nagle, being sworn according to law, deposes and says: that he was elected a delegate to the Fourth Legislative District Republican Convention of Allegheny County, from the Second district of the Thirteenth ward of the City of Pittsburgh, and as such delegate, under the rules of the County Committee, substituted Samuel J. Dawson of the same district to attend the convention in his place. As allegations tending to impugn the motives and character of affiant have been made by the Blaine faction in the public press, affiant deems it his duty to make a statement of the matter under oath from the beginning to explain his position. On Tuesday, March 25th, 1884, Mr. T. A. Blackmore, a resident of the Thirteenth ward, called on me, and asked me to become a candidate as district delegate to the Fourth Legislative Convention in the interest and for the election of Andrew Fulton, Mr. Fording, Mr. Hyndman and Mr. Reed as delegates to the Republican State Convention. This I then and there consented to do and commenced my canvass the same evening. day I had no opposition, and was duly elected. During the short time of my canvass for such district delegate, I told several people residents and voters thereof who votes for me, that I was a delegate in the interest of and would vote for the election of anti-Blaine

delegates to the convention. On Monday, March 31st, 1884, Florence C. Miller, Esq., a political friend of Mr. Blaine, and a resident of the Thirteenth ward, called on me and offered me \$35 if I would transfer my credentials to the person he would name. This I refused. He then told me to name my price, and go with him to the bank and get the money. This I also refused, and told him I was not purchasable. In conclusion, I reiterate and state emphatically, that I ran as a delegate at the solicitation of Mr. Blackmore for Andrew Fulton and the others named as delegates to the Republican State Convention, and I declined to either be bulldozed or bribed out of the position that I was bound in honor to In conclusion I state that the reason I substituted Mr. Dawson to act in my place in the convention was that I was afraid of personal injury being done me, as Mr. Miller and Mr. Powers both threatened me and said if I did not act with them a committee would wait on me and drive me out of the ward. They went so far as to make these threats in the presence of my wife. I further state that my substitute, Mr. Dawson, voted in the convention as I intended to do from the moment I became a delegate. I will state also in conclusion, that on Friday, March 30th, 1884, the day before the election of the said district delegates, Mr. C. L. Powers called on me and requested me to withdraw as a delegate, and allow him to take my place. He said he would pay me well for it. refused to withdraw, he then ran as a Citizens' delegate to the 43d Senatorial Convention, I did all that I could to defeat him and voted for his opponent.

JACOB NAGLE.

Sworn and subscribed this 12th day of April, 1884.

J. O. Brown,

Prothonotary.

ALLEGHENY COUNTY, 88.

Henry L. Best, being duly sworn according to law, doth depose and say, that he was elected a delegate from the 1st district, 31st ward, Pittsburgh, to the Fourth Legislative District Convention, and as such delegate attended the convention and voted for Messrs. Fulton,

Hyndman, Reed and Fording, as delegates to the Republican State Convention; that during the time of the convention, when I was temporarily absent from the convention, Mr. Chas. Loderer, who resides on Eighteenth street, 26th ward, Pittsburgh, approached me and offered me fifty dollars, (\$50), if I would go into the convention and vote for the Blaine delegates. I informed him that I was not purchasable, that five times that amount would not buy my vote.

HENRY L. BEST.

Sworn and subscribed to before me, 12th day of April, 1884.

J. O. Brown,

Prothonotary.

(From the Pittsburgh Commercial Gazette, April 2d, 1884.)

## REPORT OF THE CONVENTION.

THE BLAINE MEN WITHDRAW FROM THE FOURTH LEGISLATIVE DISTRICT CONVENTION.

The Fourth Legislative Convention met in Select Council Chamber at 3 o'clock. Mr. George T. Oliver in calling the convention to order said that the warmth of the contest and closeness would probable make his task a difficult one, but he would endeavor to be fair. For Temporary Secretaries Benjamin Weaver, David Rees and Charles R. Miller were elected for the Blaine men, and R. W. Thompson P. W. Seibert and James McKnight for the anti-Blaine men.

The making up of the roll was then proceeded with, the presentation of credentials occupying considerable time. When the Third district of the Twenty-third ward was called, Mr. Houseman wanted to know whether the contest which the Blaine men desired to make in that district should go before the Committee on Contested Seats.

Mr. Oliver said he could not rule on anything that was not before the him. He had no papers that indicated a contest in that district. Some papers had been presented to him the day before, but they were not in proper form.

Mr. Houseman said he held the papers, in which it was certified that

notice had been given.

The Chair—But you are too good a lawyer, Mr. Houseman, to call that

proof of service.

The matter was dropped until the roll was completed. Chairman Oliver then said that Mr. Gutelius had made affidavit that he had presented the papers in the contest in the Third district of the Twenty-third ward, and

he (Mr. Oliver) had refused to accept them. Mr. Oliver said that was a mistake. He had simply returned the papers to Mr. Gutelius showing wherein they were imperfect. Mr. Gutelius took them and promised to return them properly prepared by 3 o'clock, but he didn't bring them back. If he had brought them the papers would have been received. At 8 o'clock in the evening, Harry Brown, the person whose seat is contested, said he had no notice of contest. Mr. Oliver thought he ought not to admit the contest, and if it was from the other side he wouldn't, but in order to be perfectly fair he would allow the contest to go to the committee.

#### THE CONTESTANTS.

The chairman then went over the list of contests and decided that all persons having credentials signed by the majority of the members of the election board were entitled to vote for Permanent Chairman. The contest of G. W. Smith in the First district, Fourteenth ward, against J. P. Andrews, was withdrawn. Mr. Smith sent a letter in which he said that the contest had not been commenced by him and was against his protest. It was therefore withdrawn. The contest in the First district of the Twenty-eighth ward was withdrawn, but Chairman Oliver said he would not permit the withdrawal, as the contest was made on the ground that the election board was not sworn, and if it were true no one was entitled to a seat from the district. Squire Shaeffer, however, said the board was sworn—he had sworn them. The contest was allowed to be withdrawn.

Nominations for Permanent Chairman were made, C. P. Tiers by the Blaine men, and Andrew Fulton by the anti-Blaine. The roll call had proceeded but few moments when Captain W. F. Aull arose and tried to get the attention of the convention to enter a protest. Squire Shaeffer jumped up and made the point of order that nothing was in order except the calling of the roll. Chairman Oliver said that the roll call must proceed, and if their was any protest to be made it must come after the roll

call was completed.

When the roll call was completed there was a difference in the count between the secretaries. The mistakes were rectified by going over the list and calling the names again where there was a difference. The result was finally announced. Fulton  $46\frac{1}{2}$ , Tiers  $44\frac{1}{2}$ . Mr. Fulton took the chair amid considerable cheering.

## THE FIRST PROTEST.

Mr. Aull then got an opportunity to enter his protest. He said before he mentioned any names he would say that a few weeks hence they would be standing together shoulder to shoulder, working for the interests of the They were all Republicans together. But he protested against the way in which the votes from the Second precinct of the Thirteenth ward, and the First district of the Twenty-sixth ward had been rendered, "thus changing the result," he continued, "so that we are thus prevented from choosing the four delegates from this convention to the State Convention. We ask that the votes be recorded as they properly belong. [Cheers.] am the last man to be a bolter, but I stand here representing the sentiment of this community, and I desire to have the votes recorded as the people expected them to be when they sent them here. We know what will be the result of the Committee on Contested Seats; we know we will be in the minority and that we will have our rights wrested from us. We ask that we have the right to select the delegates to Harrisburg. If we are not permitted to do it we will not bolt, but we will retire and choose them. We propose to choose our candidates in this convention if we can, in another if we must."

Cheers and groans, the latter being continued, interrupted the speaker at this point.

Mr. Magee—I hope the delegates will give Mr. Aull a respectful

hearing.

Mr. Aull added in conclusion that they would remain and fight step by

step for their rights.

Mr. C. L. Magee—This is a representative body, and each delegate has as much right to protection as Mr. Aull. The gentleman from the Twenty-sixth ward was elected to represent the interest he does and to do just as he has done. It is the same in the Thirteenth ward.

Mr. Aull—Were they not elected for Blaine?

Mr. Magee—I don't know; let them answer for themselves; but it is not the right of the gentleman from the First district of the Twenty-first ward to question them —I let no man question my right to vote for whom I please. Let the gentlemen make their contest in the State Convention. I hope they will make it. But I think the result will be the same there that it is here.

One of the Secretaries—A man has a right to represent the people, but

he has no right to misrepresent them.

John Coslett, the delegate from the First district, Twenty-sixth ward, to whom Capt. Aull referred, came forward and said: "I didn't come here to represent one man; I came to represent the Republican party, and

I'm going to do that now."

Mr. Magee—Some time before this convention I was met by a reporter of the Commercial Gazette and interviewed as to my opinion about the convention, and as to who was my choice for President. I said I didn't want to go to the National Convention as an instructed delegate. I don't care who is chosen, whether it is Mr. Blaine or Mr. Edmunds, or Mr. Anybody, so that it is the man who it will be found it is best for the party to choose.

Mr. Houseman arose to second the protest of Mr. Aull, and was proceeding to do so when he was called to order by Chairman Fulton, who ruled that the convention must proceed with the business. The chairman and vice-chairman proceeded to select the members of the Committee on Contested Seats.

The Committee on Contested Seats was announced, as follows: Messrs. C. L. Miller, T. J. Dougherty, F. H. Fritz, James Drake, Wm. Dierst, John Thomas and M. Brobecht. Messrs. Miller and Brobecht declined to serve, and Messrs. White and Donley were appointed in their place. The committee retired, and the convention indulged in general talk without taking a recess.

After waiting until 5.45, Chairman Fulton suggested that they might as well go on with the nominations for delegates to the State Convention. Capt. Aull objected to the nominations being made until the Committee on Contested Seats had reported. The Chair stated that it would expedite matters to have the roll call made, omitting the names of those whose seats are contested, and who were on the committee.

Capt. Aull.—We'll decline to vote.

The nominations for the anti-Blaine men were made, as follows: Andrew

Fulton, Robert A. Reed, Thomas Fording and J. B. Hyndman.

Although it had been announced that the gentleman who was to make the nominations for the Blaine men was out, attending the Committee on Contested Seats, some one commenced the nominations, giving the names of Messrs. Hartzell and Irwin. They were withdrawn, however, before anything further was done.

#### THE COMMITTEE'S REPORT.

The Committee on Contested Seats came in at a quarter past 7 o'clock. They reported that all the sitting members were entitled to seats except in the case of the Second district, Eighteenth ward, where Andrew Harper was seated in place of Thomas Roodman, and the First district of the Thirtieth ward, where Richard Thomas was given the seat in place of Patrick Hoskins. It was also decided that no one was entitled to a seat from the Second district of the Twentieth ward, as the election was not valid, an extra member of the board having been taken in to assist in counting the vote.

The Chairman ordered that the roll be corrected in accordance with the

report, which the secretaries proceeded to do.

Capt. Aull—There was a minority report from the committee—what has become of that?

Mr. C. L. Magee hunted up the rules of the County Committee and read Rule 10, which says that twenty names shall be selected by the chairman and vice-chairman of the convention to constitute a Committee on Contested Seats; the chairman shall first strike off one name and the vice-chairman another until only seven are left. All contests shall be referred to this committee, and its decision shall be final and without appeal.

Mr. Houseman—But we want to file a minority report. We haven't it

ready just yet.

Mr. Magee—You can put it in if you want to, but you can't substitute it for the report already adopted.

Prof. Ford said that the matter was already decided and nothing was in

order but the roll call, which had already been ordered.

Mr. Houseman—But we want to put in the minority report as a substitute.

#### AS A LAWYER.

Mr. Ford—But it's not right, Mr. Houseman, and as a lawyer, you know it.

Mr. Houseman—Maybe under the rules it can't be done, but I hold that under parliamentary rules a minority report can be offered.

Mr. Ford—Where in a parliamentary body did you ever hear of a special rule being superceded by a general parliamentary regulation?

Mr. Houseman—Well, I want to know if the minority report has been

received.

The Chair—Yes, sir; it is received.

Mr. Houseman—Then I move that it be adopted in place of the majority report.

The Chair—The motion is not in order. The report of the committee has been adopted and the names placed on the roll.

The roll was then called to see if all the members were present.

Mr. John A. Reed, who had the credentials, wanted to know why the Second district of the Twenty-second ward had been disfranchised. The

Chair would not entertain any explanation.

Prof. Ford again formally nominated Messrs. Fulton, Hyndman, Reed and Fording. Capt. Aull nominated Messrs. Wm. M. Hartzell, George W. Irwin, S. D. Warmeastle and W. C. Taylor. The roll call was immediately commenced. When the Second district of the Thirteenth ward was called and recorded, Capt. Aull endeavored to get the attention of the Chair. Secretary James McKnight kept on calling the roll, while the chairman used the gavel vigorously. Capt. Aull finally got his voice above the din to say that they demanded that the vote be recorded for them. The uproar became greater, and Capt. Aull exclaimed: "If you will not accord us a hearing here, we will go where we will get a hearing."

C. L. Magee—There is nothing in order but the calling of the roll.

You can make your protest afterward.

#### NOW IS THE TIME.

Capt. Aull—No; now is the time.

Prof. Ford—You can't change the vote of a representative body.

By this time nearly all the Blaine delegates were gathered in the aisle behind Capt. Aull and Mr. Houseman, having their hats in their hands and their overcoats on their arms. Capt. Aull led the march toward the door, all the other Blaine delegates following. A storm of groans and hisses went up from the anti-Blaine faction, with yells of "Go, go, we're glad to get rid of you." As the procession neared the door, Mr. C. L. Magee cried out, "Majorities never bolt."

This brought back Capt. Aull, who advanced to the front of the desk, and exclaimed in a stentorian tone, almost drowned by the yells of the op-

position:

"But minorities have rights which they dare maintain, and which

majorities must respect."

Mr. Houseman stated to the chairman, but could not be heard two feet away, that they proposed to appeal the case to the State Convention.

The Blaine men then filed out, and as soon as order was restored the roll call was resumed. The name of C. L. Magee was the first one called, and he voted for Fulton, Fording, Reed and Hyndman in a tone that brought down the house.

The rest of the proceedings were very quiet, and when the roll call was completed it was announced that the result was as follows:

Fulton,	Hartzell	$5\frac{1}{2}$
Fording48 $\frac{1}{2}$	Irwin	$5\frac{1}{2}$
Reed $47\frac{1}{2}$	Warmcastle	$5\frac{1}{2}$
Hyndman48 $\frac{1}{2}$	Taylor	$5\frac{1}{2}$

The first four named were declared elected delegates to the State Convention.

Mr. C. L. Magee—The business of this convention having been concluded, I move that we adjourn, with three cheers for the Republican nominees for President and Vice President, whoever they may be.

The cheers were given and the convention adjourned.

### THE BLAINE CHANGE OF BASE.

FOUR DELEGATES ELECTED TO GO TO HARRISBURG—MAJOR BROWN BROUGHT IN.

When the Blaine delegates left the Fourth Legislative Convention in City Hall they formed in line, double file, behind Major Aull and M. H. Houseman, and began a march for their headquarters on Fourth avenue. They were cheered on their way down, and when they assembled in the *Iron Age* rooms so much enthusiasm prevailed that they forgot to organize for several minutes. Finally Mr. C. P. Tiers was called to the chair, and the secretaries and other officers who represented the Blaine people in the convention were continued.

Major Aull opened the ball with a forcible speech, in which he said: "All districts must be represented in the convention by their delegates according to the sentiment of the people as expressed at the primaries. They have stolen two of our men, Jacob Nagle and John Coslett. We had  $46\frac{1}{2}$  delegates on the floor of that convention, and if we had been given justice before the count on contested seats we would have had  $48\frac{1}{2}$  delegates. We stand up for a principle which should impel delegates to vote as intended by the people who elect them. [Cheers.]

#### ON TO HARRISBURG.

Mr. Houseman spoke in favor of electing delegates to be present at Harrisburg. "Fraud vitiates every agreement," he exclaimed, "and I could not stay in a convention where it was going on to the defeat of the will of the constituents represented" The roll call showed  $46\frac{1}{2}$  delegates present, two contestants being admitted. There were groans and hisses when the names of Ford, Magee and Fulton were called from the Fourteenth ward When it was found that none but Blaine men were present, the election of Hartzell, Irwin, Warmcastle and Taylor was made unanimous.

Charles Scully then moved a vote of thanks for Major Aull and M. H.

Houseman, Esq., for the gallant fight which they made against the Republican ring and against white slavery in Pittsburgh. It was passed with prolonged cheers.

Mr. Houseman moved that the delegates of the Fourth Legislative District be instructed to support Major A. M. Brown for delegate-at-large to

Chicago. Unanimously adopted.

Pending adjournment a Committee on Resolutions was appointed consisting of Messrs. Rankin, Houseman, Aull, Beinhaur and Biggert, to report

to-day.

Major Aull, in closing the meeting, made remarks giving a seething rebuke to the ring. He said: "I want to be on record as for the right. They told me this is my political death. If it is, I grasp it with pleasure rather than surrender my principles. We are not bolters. We simply withdrew to preserve our political integrity." [Deafening cheers.]

After giving three hearty cheers for Blaine, the convention adjourned.

Comments of Pittsburgh papers supporting Mr. Blaine on the Fourth Legislative Convention:

Dispatch, April 2, 1884.

## THE CITIZENS' CONTEST.

The state of the dispute over the election of delegates in the Fourth Legislative District may be summarized by the statement that the machine has got a good *prima facie* case, by methods which will not bear exposure. But until the citizens' party can obtain direct evidence of the practices by which the control of Tuesday's convention was obtained, it will hardly be able to establish a case for the unseating of the machine delegates.

The control of the convention was evidently secured by the votes of two men who were permitted to be elected ostensibly as Blaine delegates, but who turned in their votes for the benefit of the machine with all the discipline of its regular attendants. The excuse of one of these men, that he would have voted for Blaine "if the Blaine men had not kept hounding him," warrants the suspicion of a discreditable bargain; but the claim of Messrs. Aull and Houseman, that the vote of the precincts should be counted for the Blaine candidates, whether the delegates voted that way or not, is hardly tenable. There was a case of plain misrepresentation there, it is true, but if people persist in voting for men who will turn their coats, they must suffer the consequences.

The feeling that there was a juggle in this matter, as well as in the report on contests, will, unless substantiated by very convincing evidence, hardly establish a case for unseating the State and national delegates who are chosen thereby. It might be properly expressed by the instrumentalities which were used so effectively in 1882; but that suggests the question whether it would now be policy to start an independent movement. The late contest has shown that the machine is disposed to be as aggressive as ever; but it has also shown that in a fair fight the people

can overthrow the machine. If the fight, which was started three weeks ago, is kept up, with the errors of the last canvass corrected, the triumph of popular supremacy will progress from its partial character to complete

victory over the machine.

Let the citizens' organization be kept up and the fight carried into municipal and county politics; let the error be avoided of associating in it, as its candidates, men who have been notorious as machine politicians of the worst kind until they quarreled with their proprietors; let the organization be made so effective that there cannot be in the future any such faux pas as having tools of the ring elected as Blaine men, and a year or two of such fighting will place the Allegheny county machine in the record of the things that have passed out of existence.

Chronicle Telegragh, April 2d, 1884.

The conventions yesterday resulted as had been previously indicated, so far as the selection of delegates to Chicago are concerned. The Twenty-third district will send Mr. Bayne and one other yet to be named, and the Twenty-second district, Messrs. Magee and Flinn. The decision in the Twenty-second district rested with the Fourth Legislative District Convention, and while the bolt causes additional complications, there is no reason to expect it will effect the purpose for which it was engineered. This opinion is given entirely outside the general question involved in the controversy. There were episodes in the convention on which the Blaine people might have based a good cause, but they were condoned by acquiescence, and when the bolt did come it was at an inopportune moment and upon a ruling clearly right.

Commercial Gazette, April 2d, 1884.

#### THE CONVENTIONS YESTERDAY.

As was feared by many, the contest for delegates to the State Convention from the Fourth Legislative District, resulted in the withdrawal in a body of the Blaine delegates. They had participated in the proceedings up until the nomination of candidates and the calling of the roll. When one of the precincts of the Thirteenth was called, the delegate, who had been substituted by the person who had been elected at the primaries, voted for the anti-Blaine candidates, when it was known to all in the precinct that the delegate who had transferred his credentials had been supported and elected as a Blaine man. This was the signal for a bolt. The Blaine delegates had declared they would not submit to such an outrage, and they took their hats and left.

The result of this proceeding will be contesting delegates from this district to the State Convention, and also to the Chicago Convention In the Twenty-third Congressional district the Blaine men had everything

their own way, and their proceedings were harmonious.

With respect to the action of the Fourth Legislative Convention we are free to say that it is sustained by the rules. In other words, the anti-Blaine delegates are technically in the right, but it may well be questioned whether their course is such as will meet the approval of the bodies to which, from present appearances, appeals will be taken. We are not in a position, at this writing, to judge of the merits of the contests passed upon by the Committee on Contested Seats, but it is claimed that Blaine delegates were unseated who were shown to have been elected and justly entitled to a voice in the convention. It is alleged, furthermore, that had the contests been fairly decided the majority of the convention would have been for Blaine.

Nevertheless, the Blaine delegates, having made the contests under the rules, and the report of the Committee on Contested Seats being "binding, without exception or appeal," they are at a serious disadvantage in carrying their case to the higher bodies. This may be said, however, that if the State Convention is overwhelmingly for Blaine, as it will be, the Committee on Contested Seats there may give the anti-Blaine delegates from this county a little of the same kind of treatment—and proceed strictly according to rule.

It is very unfortunate that the rupture occurred, as it will serve to provoke fresh antagonisms and keep alive a spirit of opposition within the organization which ought to be conciliated and allayed. It was resolved by the State Convention of 1882, after a contest which must remain memorable, that "the largest freedom consistent with party organization" should be permitted at the primaries, and every step which tends to abridge that freedom and stifle the popular sentiment is a step in the wrong direction. The right of the Blaine men to contest is unquestionable, but whether they will succeed or not is another matter.

Dispatch, April 5th, 1884.

#### A NARROW ESCAPE FOR THE MACHINE.

When the alternative of fighting the machine on its own ground, or of holding the "separate popular delegate conventions" authorized by the national rule, was under discussion, the *Dispatch* expressed the opinion that the former course would result in a victory for popular representation in the Twenty-third congressional district, and in the continuance of machine control in the Twenty-second. The result seems to have justified that prophecy.

The citizens' movement developed greater strength on this side of the Allegheny than was anticipated. Indeed, although the machine has got the prima facie control of the majority of the delegates in the Pittsburgh district, there is strong ground for believing that the citizens fairly won the day. But on the face of the returns the regulars have carried the fight in this district; and the result warrants the inquiry whether the protest against ring methods would not have been more emphatic and the chances for success better, if the citizens had refused to accept the handicapped fight offered them by the county committee's method, but had insisted on their right to popular delegate conventions.

While the results of the fight in the Fourth Legislative District are disappointing to those who had expected a more decisive victory over the

machine, the outcome of the whole movement has been well worth the struggle. The politicians have only saved their political existence by capturing a single convention where the scale was turned by delegates who misrepresented their constituents. What will be the outcome of the bolt, and the contest it foreshadows, cannot well be foretold. But with the attempt of the leaders to capture the Twenty-third district wholly balked, with a majority of anti-machine men in the Allegheny county delegation to the state convention, and with the ring driven to save its life by a desperate fight in its last stronghold, the people may congratulate themselves on having given machine politics a decided lesson.

